

Eleventh Floor, Menzies Building
Monash University, Wellington Road
CLAYTON Vic 3800 AUSTRALIA

Telephone:
(03) 9905 2398, (03) 9905 5112

Fax:
(03) 9905 2426

e-mail:
Internet home page:

from overseas:
61 3 9905 2398 or
61 3 9905 5112

61 3 9905 2426

impact@buseco.monash.edu.au

<http://www.monash.edu.au/policy/>

The Economic Impacts of a Construction
Project, using SinoTERM, a
Multi-regional CGE model
of China

by

MARK HORRIDGE
AND
GLYN WITTWER

*Centre of Policy Studies
Monash University*

General Working Paper No. G-164 June 2007

ISSN 1 031 9034

ISBN 0 7326 1571 2

The Centre of Policy Studies (COPS) is a research centre at Monash University devoted to quantitative analysis of issues relevant to Australian economic policy.

CENTRE of

POLICY

STUDIES and

the IMPACT

PROJECT

The economic impacts of a construction project, using SinoTERM, a multi-regional CGE model of China

Mark Horridge and Glyn Wittwer¹

Abstract

The paper outlines the theory and database preparation of SinoTERM, a “bottom-up” computable general equilibrium model of the Chinese economy. The methodology by which we construct the multi-regional model allows us to present the economy of China in an unprecedented amount of detail. SinoTERM covers all 31 provinces and municipalities. The database of the model extends the published national input-output table for 2002 to 137 sectors. The single crops sector in the published national input-output table is split into 11 and the single livestock sector into three.

The multi-regional CGE model provides a framework that we could modify to apply to many different policy applications. We can use SinoTERM to analyse the regional economic impacts of region-specific shocks. Such shocks could major construction projects or investments in health and education sectors, in an effort to accelerate economic growth in the lagging inland provinces.

We use a 63 sector, 10 region aggregation of the SinoTERM master database to model the regional economic impacts of the proposed Chongqing-Lichuan rail link construction project.

JEL classification: C68, R13, L74

Keywords: CGE modelling, regional modelling, construction projects

¹ Both of the Centre of Policy Studies, Monash University, Australia. Correspondence should be emailed to Glyn.Wittwer@BusEco.monash.edu.au

Table of Contents

Introduction.....	1
Previous studies on regional China.....	1
The theory of SinoTERM	2
Preparation of the SinoTERM database.....	3
Adding sectoral detail to the national database.....	3
Gathering regional data.....	3
Generating regional input-output tables and inter-regional trade matrices	4
Generating inter-regional trade matrices	4
Economic impacts of the Chongqing Railway Development Project: construction phase.....	5
The operational phase of the Chongqing Railway Project.....	8
a For rail freight, which becomes more efficient, we report an input-based measure of activity. Output, measured in ton-kilometres would increase.....	12
Potential modifications to SinoTERM.....	12
Conclusion	14
References.....	14

The economic impacts of a construction project, using SinoTERM, a multi-regional CGE model of China

Mark Horridge and Glyn Wittwer

Introduction

The regional implications of economic reform are an increasingly important question for China. In March 2006, the National People's Congress of China approved a five-year plan to tackle the wealth gap between cities and the countryside. Li Chong'an, a National People's Congress deputy, noted a shift in policy from "urban development and heavy investment... to increasing rural and sci-tech investment in the interest of sustainable development."² Recent policies proposed include providing free compulsory primary education in rural regions and increasing farm investment (World Bank, 2005). With growing policy concerns surrounding economic inequalities between the regions of China, a general equilibrium model that uses input-output data on all 31 provinces and municipalities of China is a valuable tool for examining various scenarios.

This paper outlines such a multi-regional computable general equilibrium model of the Chinese economy. The model is SinoTERM, based on the Australian TERM: **The Enormous Regional Model**. SinoTERM contains a unique amount of detail, in providing input-output data for 137 sectors in 31 regions of China.

Previous studies on regional China

China's rapid economic growth over the past quarter-century has not resulted in convergence between regions. Yang (2002) attributes the widening inequality in China to fiscal and credit policies that have been biased towards urban activities; the establishment of special economic zones in coastal regions with superior tax treatments and preferential resource allocations (also noted by Démurger et al., 2002); and factor market distortions, including restrictions on labour movements plus poor housing markets, pension and health care arrangements. Chang (2002) attributes much of the growing inequality in China to a widening divide between urban and rural incomes, and regards accelerated urbanization as the cure. Fan and Zhang (2004), on the other hand, are more concerned with the link between infrastructure provision, education and productivity growth, leading to rural economic development. This view is supported by Li and Liu (2006), who also note a need to strengthen linkages between domestic banks and the non-state sector. Zhang and Kanbur (2006) present details of the inequalities in education and health between urban and rural households, across provinces and within provinces, and within both urban and rural areas.

All agree that policies and reforms in China should be directed at reducing inequalities between regions and between urban and rural households, particularly given the spectacular economic growth that has come with liberalisation. As is apparent from the differences outlined in the previous paragraph, the choice of policies to counter growing inequality is more

² (Downloaded from <http://www.china.org.cn/english/2006lh/161484.htm>; accessed 10 March 2007).

controversial. Many inland regions are isolated by mountain ranges. Transport links to adjacent provinces follow circuitous routes and have limited carrying capacity. Some policy-makers may assert that transport infrastructure is the highest priority. Others may regard the divide between urban and rural access to health and education as a larger cause of inequality.

SinoTERM contains sufficient detail at the provincial/municipal level to evaluate the regional economic impacts of various policy measures. The remainder of this paper outlines the theory and database preparation of SinoTERM, followed by an illustrative application to the proposed Chongqing-Lichuan rail link construction project.

The theory of SinoTERM

The equation system of SinoTERM is similar to other models of the TERM family and is described in Horridge et al. (2005). SinoTERM has a number of features to help model regional economic issues. These features include:

- Full input-output databases, inter-regional trade matrices and behavioural equations for each province, so that prices and quantities are solved uniquely for each region. In effect, there is a complete CGE model for each province, with provincial economies linked by flows of goods and labour. 137 sectors are distinguished.
- Very detailed margins information, showing, for example, the cost of rail transport used to transport vegetables from Hebei to Beijing. 8 margin goods are distinguished: covering Rail, Road, Water and Air freight costs, as well as the costs of Pipelines, Warehousing, Trade (retail+wholesale) and Insurance. The detailed margins data enables us to simulate rather specific scenarios, such as an improvement in highways between two regions. The model allows for providers of transport services to be located in a different province than either the producers or users of the goods being transported.
- We incorporate detailed tax matrices, to allow for the possibility (either in the original data or as part of a simulation) that tax rates on a particular good might vary both between regions and users. This makes it possible to simulate, say, a special subsidy for Inner Mongolian farmers who use diesel fuel. On the other hand our framework does not allow for fully bilateral variation in commodity taxes: we insist that Shanghai must tax Beijing beer and Jiangsu beer at the same rate³.
- Using a combination of cleverly formulated equations, a well structured database and efficient solution software (GEMPACK), we are able to solve a fully multi-regional model of 137 sectors and 31 regions – an order of magnitude larger than achieved using other methods. Nevertheless, with so much detail, solution times are long—and simulation results are voluminous.
- To combat these problems, we have automated the aggregation of sectors and regions to reduce the database size. This allows the modeller to focus on a particular issue while retaining the theoretical features of the full model, yet speeding up solution times and easing presentation of simulation results. We emphasize that the aggregation—which sectors and regions are combined—will be specific to each problem. Often we may not wish to separately distinguish Shaanxi or Apples; at other times it will be essential.

³ This is a point of difference with many-country models of world trade, like GTAP.

Preparation of the SinoTERM database

We describe below how we constructed what may be the largest input-output dataset ever constructed for China – around six million numbers.⁴ In a nutshell, our approach is: *for a bottom-up model, use top-down data – but with lots of sectors and regions.*

Adding sectoral detail to the national database

The National Bureau of Statistics (NBS) (2006) has published a 2002 input-output table for the national economy containing 122 sectors⁵. Only 3 of these sectors are agricultural: crops, livestock and other agriculture. Considering the large proportion of the population employed in agriculture, and the regional differences between agricultural activities, we felt it important to add more agricultural detail. We therefore split some agricultural and food sectors in the national input-output table. We split the single crops sector into soybeans, corn, wheat, rice, millet, vegetables, apples, citrus, grapes, cotton and other crops, the single livestock sector into pigs, sheep/goats and other livestock and the single eggs, dairy and meat sector into four. The main source of data for the split of agriculture and food was FAO (2006). These sectoral splits enlarged the published input-output table to 137 sectors.

Gathering regional data

The minimal regional data requirements for the 27 provinces and 4 municipalities in SinoTERM master database are:

- regional shares of national output for each of 137 sectors;
- regional shares of national consumption, for both rural and urban households;
- estimates of international exports and imports by sector and province; and
- shares of government expenditure at the regional level for each sector.

The NSB (2006) yearbook contains many provincial/municipal data that assisted us in obtaining regional shares of national activity for many of the 137 sectors in the SinoTERM master database. The yearbook provides provincial value-added totals at a relatively broad sectoral level. In addition, individual chapters within the yearbook contain further sectoral data. We are indebted to Xiaohu Liu and his team at the Institute of Agricultural Economics, Chinese Academy of Agricultural Sciences, Beijing, who compiled some of the data on manufacturing shares. The USDA (2006) has compiled regional data used in the splitting of the national database for agriculture. We struggled to find suitable regional data for mining. Sources included China.org.cn, the NBS (2006) yearbook and Wikipedia. We anticipate that we will improve regional data in collaboration with Chinese researchers in the future.

The national input-output table presents household consumption for two households, rural and urban. The yearbook in turn contains estimates of average consumption for each household by province. We used these sectoral data (39 sectors by province for urban and 8 sectors by province for rural households) to estimate regional shares of national activity. In some sectors, we imposed additional judgments on the data. For example, we assumed that households used no coal in southern provinces that did not have significant coal production.

A World Bank report (2005) provided government expenditure on health by provinces. Only 18 out of 122 sectors have non-zero government spending in the published input-output table.

⁴ Previous estimates of a multi-regional input-output database for China include Okuda *et al.* (2004), comprising 38 sectors and 30 regions for 1997.

⁵ Our thanks to Yang-Jun of the Center for Chinese Agricultural Policy (CCAP) for finding and translating this IO table.

For sectors other than health, we set government spending shares equal to population shares, and subsequently adjusted these shares to sum to published government spending totals by region. We are seeking better estimates of regional shares of total government expenditure.

The NSB yearbook publishes regional values of international export and import totals. The yearbook also contains international tourism exports by region. We based commodity-level estimates of regional shares of national exports on our initial estimates of regional excess supply, then adjusted these to match provincial/municipal totals. International import shares were set equal to each region's aggregate share of national aggregate imports.

Generating regional input-output tables and inter-regional trade matrices

A methodology described in Horridge et al. (2005) was used to split the national input-table database into 31 regional IO tables, and to construct inter-regional trade matrices. This methodology does not rely on obtaining mutually consistent input-output tables for individual provinces. Rather, using the assumption that industry technologies are similar in different regions, regional shares of national activity provide the basis for regional input-output information. That is, no regional information overrides the national database.

The procedure relies on having a high level of sectoral detail. Clearly we could not assume that "agriculture" has the same production structure in Hainan and Inner Mongolia. However, it is much more reasonable to assume that "millet" has a similar technology in those provinces where it is grown. As mentioned previously, we will often, for a particular simulation, combine various sectors of our huge database so that the size of the model is reduced. For example, in examining the effects of a services trade agreement, we might be content with a single "agriculture" sector. However, because within agriculture the mix of original sectors differs between regions, the technology of the aggregated sector "agriculture" will also exhibit regional variation.

The alternative approach, as mentioned above, would be to use published input-output tables for individual provinces. Usually, such tables would contain less sectoral detail, be less up-to-date, and might also be of lesser quality than the national statistics, e.g., they might be noisy or not add up to the national data. Our experience has been that this method is very time-consuming, and might indeed never be concluded. We also think that many insights into the data arise during the process of analysing simulations, and so it is important to begin simulating as soon as possible, even while the database is still being improved. Our admittedly mechanical approach allows us to reach this stage much quicker. Later, when we have time (and more Chinese collaborators), we will be free to incorporate into our database any plausible regional variations in technology implied by published regional IO tables.

Generating inter-regional trade matrices

Our model database requires, for each of 137 Chinese-produced commodities, a 31x31 matrix showing interregional trade flows. A similar matrix records flows of imported goods. 8 more such matrices record margin (transport) costs for each of the trade flows.

Clearly such voluminous arrays of data could never be observed directly. Like other regional modellers, we assume that trade flows, for a given good, are inversely proportional to distance⁶ travelled (the gravity assumption). And we assume that some goods (eg, health services) are much less traded than others.

⁶ The "distance" should be measured along a very good road—it is rightly a measure of transport difficulty rather than a mere map distance. So two neighbour provinces, separated by impassable mountains, are economically widely separated.

Once again, sectoral detail comes to our rescue. Clearly, for any good which is produced (or consumed) in one province only, the trade matrix contains no additional information (our regional IO tables already tell us demand and supply by region). The more detailed are our sectors, the more likely is this extreme case to be approximated. For example, it is much easier to estimate trade in “citrus” than in a wider “fruit” grouping.

There remain some sectors, e.g. Medicine, which seem easily tradeable and are produced and consumed everywhere. So far, we have not observed how much medicine is traded between provinces—and so we rely more heavily on the gravity assumption to generate a plausible trade pattern. However, if medicines from different regions are very good substitutes⁷, and if their transport costs are low, our model results will actually be insensitive to the assumed initial trade pattern.

Economic impacts of the Chongqing Railway Development Project: construction phase

NSB (2006) provides a list of major infrastructure projects. We chose the Chongqing rail project for our application because we were able to obtain ample background material from a report prepared for the Asian Development Bank (Ministry of Railways, 2006). The Chongqing rail project consists of constructing an electrified double track that connects Chongqing with Lichuan in western Hubei. The track will have a total length of 244.3 km. It will include 13.5 km of connecting lines, two new passenger and freight stations and upgrading of two existing stations. As the proposed track will cut through mountainous terrain, the civil works are substantial: 88% of its total length will consist of bridges (12%) and tunnels (76%). The estimated cost of the project, to proceed over four years from 2007 to 2010, will be 4 billion yuan per annum for each of these years. This rail project is part of a larger plan to link Shanghai, Nanjing, Hefei, Wuhan, Yichang, Chongqing and Chengdu by rail.

When the rail link is operational, it will carry passengers at 200 kilometres per hour. It will provide a much quicker link between Chongqing and other cities than existing railways. The link will provide cheaper passenger transport to the seaboard than air travel and will also boost the passenger carrying capacity to Chongqing, thereby enhancing tourism. In addition, it will lower the costs of freight. The Ministry of Railways (2006) anticipates that mineral deposits relatively close to the line will be developed further. There are 350 million cubic meters of proven natural gas reserves and 200 million tons of coal along the catchment area. Lower freight costs will increase the volume of manufactured goods between inland and coastal China, thereby contributing to economic development in relatively slow-growing inland provinces.

Since so much of the track will consist of bridges and tunnels, permanent land acquisitions will be limited to 592 hectares. The project will also make temporary use of an additional 502 hectares. Relocation will be necessary for 326 farm families who will lose their land and for 411 households who will lose their houses.

The economic benefits of the operational phase will be accompanied by some environmental benefits. The Ministry’s environmental assessment report estimates that electrified freight trains generate 0.24% of the carbon monoxide and 1.8% of the carbon dioxide emissions of trucks per freight ton-km, and much lower levels of other pollutants, even if fuelled by coal-fired electricity. In all probability, trains on the new line will be powered by hydro-electricity

⁷ That is to say, there is effectively a single national price for medicine.

from the Yangtse basin. The energy consumption estimates reported by the Ministry are 0.35 MJ/ton-km for rail and 2.1 MJ/ton-km for truck transport.

Table 1: Macroeconomic effects of construction phase
(short run, % change relative to base case)

	National	Hubei	Chongqing	Hunan	Sichuan	Guizhou	Shaanxi	South China	East China	NE China	West China
Real consumption	0.027	0.16	0.46	0.01	0.02	0.02	0.02	0.00	0.00	0.01	0.02
Real investment	0.103	1.48	2.42	0.01	0.01	0.01	0.01	-0.01	0.00	0.01	0.01
Real Govt	0.000	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
Exp Volume	-0.115	-0.29	-0.47	-0.15	-0.16	-0.16	-0.14	-0.11	-0.11	-0.12	-0.16
Import Volume	0.065	0.40	0.91	0.05	0.07	0.07	0.06	0.03	0.04	0.05	0.07
RealGDP	0.007	0.07	0.20	0.00	0.01	0.01	0.01	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.01
Agg CapStock (K)	0.000	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
Agg Employ (L)	0.009	0.07	0.20	0.01	0.01	0.01	0.01	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.01
Ave producer wage (w)	0.005	-0.04	-0.11	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.01	0.00	0.00	0.00
Ave capital price (r)	0.010	0.14	0.44	0.00	0.01	0.02	0.01	-0.01	0.00	0.00	0.01
Ave real wage	0.011	0.09	0.25	0.01	0.01	0.01	0.01	0.00	0.00	0.01	0.01
GDP deflator	0.056	0.23	0.51	0.05	0.07	0.07	0.06	0.03	0.04	0.05	0.06
CPI	0.050	0.10	0.16	0.05	0.06	0.06	0.05	0.04	0.04	0.04	0.05
Export PI	0.029	0.07	0.12	0.04	0.04	0.04	0.04	0.03	0.03	0.03	0.04
Construction price	0.073	0.45	0.77	0.05	0.07	0.07	0.06	0.04	0.04	0.04	0.06

In order to model the economic impacts of the Chongqing rail project, this study reports two simulations. The first deals with the construction phase in a short-run setting and the second with the operational phase in a long-run environment. The construction phase provides a larger proportional stimulus to Chongqing's economy than Hubei's, because base case investment in the rail sectors in Hubei is several-fold larger than in Chongqing. We assume that the value of investment in the two regions is equal.

In the short-run setting of the construction simulation, we assume that in each region there is an upward-sloping labour supply curve.⁸ The construction phase pushes the regional demand for out in Hubei and Chongqing, so that the labour market adjusts via a combination of rising real wages and increased employment. In Hubei and Chongqing, real wages rise (deflated by CPI) by 0.09% and 0.25% respectively, with employment increases of 0.07% and 0.20%. National employment increases, so that additional employment in Hubei and Chongqing is not entirely at the expense of jobs in other regions. Capital stocks are exogenous in the short run, based on the assumption that there is insufficient time for adjustment. The additional demands arising in the construction phase raise the marginal product of capital in the absence of any increase in capital stocks, so real capital rentals rise (r is the capital rental minus the GDP deflator). Any increase/decrease in regional aggregate employment (indicating a decrease/increase in the K/L ratio if capital is fixed) must be accompanied by a decrease/increase in real producer wages (w , nominal wages minus the GDP deflator) relative to the rate of return on capital (r). It so happens that w falls in both Hubei (-0.04%) and Chongqing (-0.11%) as the average price of capital rises: hence w/r falls, in line with the fall

⁸ The elasticity of provincial labour supply w.r.t. the local real wage is set to 1.0. Extra workers could come from (a) the underemployed and (b) other provinces.

in the K/L ratio induced by the construction project. So, real wages rise in terms of consumer prices at the same time as real producer wages fall in both Hubei and Chongqing. This is because construction demands push up the GDP deflator more than CPI in the two regions. The reason for this is that the price increase of construction (0.77% in Chongqing and 0.45% in Hubei, table 1, bottom row) is much larger than that of other commodities. Construction is an investment activity and therefore appears in expenditure-side GDP, but not in household consumption.

The stimulus of the construction project on Chongqing and Hubei induces a real appreciation in these two regions as the price of relatively non-traded construction rises relative to other goods and services. The real appreciation results in real domestic absorption increasing by a larger percentage than real GDP in these two regions. Hence, real consumption increases by 0.16% and real investment by 1.48% in Hubei, while regional real GDP increases by only 0.07%. The corresponding changes in Chongqing are 0.46% (consumption), 2.42% (investment) and 0.20% (real GDP). The increasing share of domestic absorption in total expenditure is evident in Table 2, which repeats the expenditure variables shown in Table 1, this time expressing them as a weighted contribution to the overall change in real GDP. Inter-regional or international exports and imports all make a negative contribution to regional real GDP in Hubei and Chongqing. That is, the real trade balances in the two regions make a negative contribution to the change in real GDP as the share of regional domestic absorption in real GDP increases.

Table 2: Contribution to expenditure-side real GDP
(short run, % change relative to base case)

	Hubei	Chongqing	Hunan	Sichuan	Guizhou	Shaanxi	SouthChina	EastChina	NEChina	WestChina
Real consumption	0.06	0.34	0.01	0.01	0.02	0.01	0.00	0.00	0.01	0.03
Real investment	0.46	1.11	0.00	0.01	0.00	0.01	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.01
Real Govt	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
Stocks	-0.01	-0.02	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
International -										
exports	-0.01	-0.03	-0.01	-0.01	-0.01	-0.01	-0.06	-0.03	-0.01	-0.01
imports	-0.01	-0.01	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	-0.03	-0.01	0.00	0.00
Inter-regional:										
exports	-0.19	-0.35	0.01	0.02	0.01	0.01	0.05	0.02	0.01	0.00
imports	-0.22	-0.79	0.00	-0.01	-0.02	-0.01	0.04	0.02	0.00	-0.02
Net margins	-0.02	-0.06	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
Total GDP	0.07	0.20	0.00	0.01	0.01	0.01	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.01

The operational phase of the Chongqing Railway Project

In modelling the operational phase of the project, we run SinoTERM with a long-run setting. We assume that there is sufficient time for capital stocks to adjust to restore pre-simulation rates of return in each industry. In the labour market, we assume that all adjustments at the national level are via real wages, with national aggregate employment unchanged. Regional labour is imperfectly mobile as in the short run. In each industry, we maintain constant investment to capital ratios. We fix the national balance of trade (export minus import values) as a share of GDP.

The project will lower the costs of transport between Chongqing and the eastern seaboard. The Yangtse River has traditionally served as a corridor from Chongqing to the east coast. In more recent history, a network of railways and highways has linked Chongqing with major cities in all directions. But the rail link to Wuhan in Hubei bends hundreds of kilometres to the north, passing through Xiangfan, before bending south to Wuhan. In addition to reducing travel times to southern Hubei, the new link will open up towns previously not served by rail. It will also increase the travel capacity for tourists.⁹

Table 3: Matrix of assumed rail freight cost savings arising from project (%)

From:	Hubei	Chongqing	Hunan	Sichuan	Guizhou	Shaanxi	SouthChina	EastChina	NEChina	WestChina
Hubei	-40	-75	0	-25	-25	-10	-3	0	0	-3
Chongqing	-75	-50	0	0	0	0	0	-15	-2	0
Hunan	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sichuan	-25	0	0	0	0	0	0	-10	-2	0
Guizhou	-25	0	0	0	0	0	0	-6	-2	0
Shaanxi	-10	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
SouthChina	-3	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
EastChina	0	-15	0	-10	-6	0	0	0	0	0
NEChina	0	-2	0	-2	-2	0	0	0	0	0
WestChina	-3	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0

We simulated the long-run benefits of the operational phase via three sets of shocks. The first two were specific to rail services. Investment in the rail link raises the capital stock during the operational phase relative to the base case: hence, the first set is an exogenous increase in capital in the rail passenger and rail freight sectors in Chongqing and Hubei. For the second set of shocks, we estimate how the rail link lowers the cost of rail freight margins by considering each origin-destination pair of regions (table 3). If freight sourced from west of the rail project travels to a destination west of the project (for example, Sichuan to west China), the impact is zero. If part of the journey from source to destination is along the Chongqing-Lichuan rail link, the project lowers freight costs. Examples are Hubei-sourced goods travel-

⁹ Xingdoushan National Nature Reserve and Dafengbao Provincial Nature Reserve are within several hours of road travel of stations along the proposed rail link.

ling to Hubei, Chongqing, Sichuan and Guizhou. For goods from Hubei travelling beyond adjacent regions, the proportional cost saving of the rail link is lower. Rail freight costs from Hubei to nearby Sichuan are 40% lower, whereas from Hubei to west China, such costs are only 3% lower. Note that the project has no impact on Hunan. This is because the rail link completed in 2006 between Chongqing and Huaihua in western Hunan overrides the potential benefit of the Chongqing-Lichuan link.

Table 4: Macroeconomic impacts of operational phase of rail project
(long run, % change relative to base case)

	National	Hubei	Chongqing	Hunan	Sichuan	Guizhou	Shaanxi	SouthChina	EastChina	NEChina	WestChina
Rail shocks											
RealHou	0.024	0.81	1.47	-0.06	0.00	-0.02	-0.09	-0.04	-0.06	-0.06	-0.02
RealInv	0.067	1.10	2.07	-0.02	0.03	0.01	-0.04	0.00	-0.02	-0.03	0.02
RealGov	0.000	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
ExpVol	0.026	0.41	0.33	0.02	0.03	0.03	0.04	0.02	0.02	0.03	0.06
ImpVolUsed	0.022	0.84	1.64	-0.04	0.01	-0.02	-0.06	-0.01	-0.04	-0.05	-0.01
RealGDP	0.036	0.77	1.35	-0.02	0.02	0.01	-0.04	0.00	-0.02	-0.02	0.02
AggCapStock	0.051	1.06	1.77	-0.03	0.04	0.01	-0.05	0.00	-0.02	-0.03	0.02
AggEmploy	0.000	0.40	0.73	-0.03	0.00	-0.01	-0.05	-0.02	-0.03	-0.03	-0.01
Averrealwage	0.062	0.46	0.79	0.03	0.06	0.05	0.02	0.04	0.03	0.03	0.05
GDPPPI	-0.001	-0.15	-0.03	0.01	0.02	0.01	-0.01	0.01	0.00	0.00	-0.01
CPI	0.000	-0.06	0.01	0.00	0.01	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
ExportPI	-0.007	-0.10	-0.08	-0.01	-0.01	-0.01	-0.01	-0.01	-0.01	-0.01	-0.01
Other productivity shocks											
RealHou	0.023	0.07	0.60	0.00	0.04	0.01	-0.02	0.02	-0.01	-0.01	0.02
RealInv	0.020	0.06	0.76	0.00	0.04	0.02	-0.01	0.01	0.00	-0.01	0.02
RealGov	0.000	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
ExpVol	0.012	0.10	1.26	0.01	0.04	0.04	0.02	0.02	0.00	0.00	0.03
ImpVolUsed	0.010	0.04	0.79	-0.01	0.02	0.00	-0.01	0.01	-0.01	-0.01	0.01
RealGDP	0.018	0.08	1.06	0.00	0.02	0.01	-0.01	0.01	-0.01	-0.01	0.02
AggCapStock	0.015	0.07	0.68	0.00	0.04	0.01	-0.01	0.02	0.00	0.00	0.03
AggEmploy	0.000	0.03	0.29	-0.01	0.01	0.00	-0.02	0.00	-0.01	-0.01	0.01
Averrealwage	0.021	0.05	0.31	0.01	0.03	0.02	0.00	0.02	0.01	0.01	0.03
GDPPPI	-0.006	-0.04	-0.59	0.01	0.01	-0.01	0.00	0.01	0.01	0.01	0.01
CPI	-0.008	-0.03	-0.21	0.00	-0.01	-0.01	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
ExportPI	-0.003	-0.03	-0.31	0.00	-0.01	-0.01	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	-0.01
Total											
RealHou	0.047	0.87	2.06	-0.06	0.04	-0.01	-0.11	-0.03	-0.07	-0.07	0.00
RealInv	0.088	1.16	2.83	-0.02	0.07	0.03	-0.05	0.01	-0.03	-0.03	0.04
RealGov	0.000	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
ExpVol	0.039	0.51	1.59	0.03	0.06	0.07	0.05	0.04	0.02	0.03	0.09
ImpVolUsed	0.032	0.88	2.44	-0.05	0.03	-0.02	-0.07	-0.01	-0.05	-0.06	0.00
RealGDP	0.055	0.85	2.41	-0.03	0.05	0.02	-0.05	0.00	-0.03	-0.03	0.03
AggCapStock	0.066	1.12	2.45	-0.02	0.07	0.02	-0.06	0.01	-0.03	-0.03	0.05
AggEmploy	0.000	0.43	1.02	-0.04	0.01	-0.01	-0.06	-0.02	-0.04	-0.04	-0.01
Averrealwage	0.083	0.51	1.10	0.04	0.09	0.07	0.02	0.06	0.04	0.04	0.07
GDPPPI	-0.007	-0.19	-0.62	0.02	0.03	0.00	-0.01	0.02	0.01	0.01	0.00
CPI	-0.008	-0.10	-0.20	0.01	0.00	-0.01	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
ExportPI	-0.010	-0.13	-0.39	-0.01	-0.02	-0.02	-0.01	-0.01	-0.01	-0.01	-0.02

The third set of shocks concerns the expectation of the Ministry of Railways that the rail link will open up coal and gas reserves to further development.¹⁰ We assume in the simulation that there is substantial productivity growth in coal mining, gas mining, rail passenger services and tourism in Chongqing, with smaller productivity shocks to the corresponding sectors in Hubei.¹¹ We report the impacts of the mining, passenger and tourism productivity shocks separately from the rail capital and productivity shocks. This way, if we think the productivity benefits to mining, rail passenger transport and tourism are unduly optimistic, we can reduce or omit any set of shocks.

It is technically possible to present sub-provincial outcomes of a SinoTERM simulation. The project will open up the Enshi Tujia and Miao Autonomous Prefecture to rail. Some versions¹² of TERM include equations for “top-down” representation of a prefecture, based on activity changes at the provincial level. At present, we have collected no Chinese data on prefecture-level production and consumption activities.

Both tables 4 and 5 show a decomposition of the macroeconomic impacts. We show the impacts of the first and second sets of shocks under the heading “Rail shocks”. The remaining shocks come under the heading “Other productivity shocks”. Table 4 details the national and regional macroeconomic effects of the operational phase of the rail project. National real GDP rises by 0.055%, with the largest regional gains in Chongqing (2.41%) and Hubei (0.85%). Other regions lose a small proportion of employment relative to the base case, given our assumption that employment is fixed in the long run. This also means that capital stocks fall slightly relative to the base case in regions other than Chongqing and Hubei.

Rail capital and productivity growth accounts for most of the movement in employment from the rest of China to Hubei and Chongqing. Employment grows by 0.73% in Chongqing from this effect, equivalent to about 150,000 jobs (table 4, 3rd column). An additional 0.29% (60,000 jobs) increase in Chongqing’s employment arises from the other imposed productivity impacts. In Hubei, total employment grows by 0.43% or 180,000 jobs. Additional investment and household consumption in these regions arising from the project results in the spreading of increased employment across many sectors (table 6).

Since by assumption, the project does not increase national employment in the long run, each row showing the labour contribution to GDP sums to zero. We see under “Rail shocks” that rail productivity and capital growth accounts for two thirds of total GDP growth (ie. 0.036% out of 0.055%). Under “Other productivity shocks”, we observe there is endogenous growth in capital stocks due to technological growth in non-rail sectors. To explain this, we define GDP (Y) as a function of underlying technology A, capital K and labour L (fixed nationally in the long run):

$$Y = AF(K, \bar{L}) \quad (1)$$

From this, we derive an economy-wide expression for the marginal product of capital:

$$\left(\frac{r}{p}\right) = AF_k(K, \bar{L}) \quad (2)$$

¹⁰ Such benefits are more likely to arise from the completion of the corridor from Shanghai to Chengdu.

¹¹ The primary factor productivity shocks ascribed were -30%, -15% , -50% and -15% in Chongqing and one tenth these shocks in Hubei. Rail freight margins shocks ascribed were -50% in Chongqing and -20% in Hubei. A -30% shock implies that the input requirements per unit of output fall by 30%.

¹² The sub-regional modelling feature has been implemented in the Australian version of TERM, and in similar models of Indonesia and Brazil. The additional data requirements are fairly modest.

Given that the rate-of-return on capital is fixed in the long run, (2) is approximately constant.¹³ This means that on the RHS, if there is technological improvement (i.e., a fall in A), then capital stocks K must rise since aggregate employment L is fixed. Hence, capital stocks growth arising from productivity gains in other sectors contributes 0.005% of the total gain in real GDP in addition to the direct productivity impact of 0.010%. Increased indirect tax revenues account for small contributions to GDP for both the rail and other industry productivity impacts. These tend to rise as industry activity rises.

Table 5: Decomposition of national real GDP, income side
(long run, % change relative to base case)

	Hubei	Chongqing	Rest of China	National
1. Rail shocks				
Labour	0.007	0.006	-0.013	0.000
Capital	0.013	0.009	-0.005	0.017
Industry productivity	0	0	0	0
Rail productivity	0.003	0.002	0.009	0.014
Taxes	0.005	0.005	-0.005	0.005
Total 1	0.029	0.023	-0.024	0.036
2. Other productivity shocks				
Labour	0.001	0.002	-0.003	0.000
Capital	0.001	0.004	0.000	0.005
Industry productivity	0.001	0.009	0.000	0.010
Rail productivity	0	0	0	0
Taxes	0.000	0.003	0.000	0.003
Total 2	0.000	0.015	0.000	0.018
1+2. Total				
Labour	0.008	0.008	-0.016	0.000
Capital	0.014	0.013	-0.005	0.022
Industry productivity	0.001	0.009	0.000	0.010
Rail productivity	0.003	0.002	0.009	0.014
Taxes	0.006	0.008	-0.006	0.008
Total	0.029	0.038	-0.026	0.055

Recall the direct impact on rail costs (table 3): the rest of China gains from the project (contributing 0.009% to national GDP growth, “Rail productivity”, table 5, column 3). This highlights one of the unique attributes of SinoTERM and other TERM models: the supply of margins originating in Chongqing and Hubei (i.e., the new rail link) can lower the costs of moving goods between provinces further afield. Neither Chongqing nor Hubei need be the origin or destination of these goods that pass along the rail link. Previous multi-regional models (for example, Naqvi and Peter, 1996) assign the margins supply of a sale either to the origin or destination of the sale.

¹³ In percentage change terms, the rate-of-return on capital is the price of capital minus the price of constructing capital. The price term in the rate-of-return expression is more activity-specific than the GDP deflator used in the marginal product of capital expression

Table 6: Sectoral impacts, output and employment

(long run, % change relative to base case)

	Output			Employment		
	Hubei	Chongqing	National	Hubei	Chongqing	National
RailPass	10.2	65.6	0.3	-5.1	-39.6	-1.0
CoalMineProc	3.9	27.1	0.1	0.8	-12.5	-0.3
CrudeOilGas	2.8	31.1	0.0	1.5	15.5	0.0
Tourism	1.9	8.9	0.2	0.7	-2.3	0.0
RailEqp	2.0	8.2	-0.1	1.9	8.0	-0.1
RailFreight ^a	-6.7	-10.0	-1.2	-23.2	-38.5	-2.2
OtherManuf	1.3	5.2	0.1	1.2	4.9	0.0
NmtlMinPr	1.3	4.3	0.1	1.2	4.2	0.1
SteelPrds	1.5	4.5	0.1	1.4	4.3	0.1
Utilities	0.6	2.5	0.1	0.4	2.2	0.0
NferrPrds	1.0	3.3	0.1	0.8	3.1	0.1
OtherManufac	1.2	3.7	0.1	1.1	3.5	0.0
Sawmills	1.2	3.3	0.1	1.0	3.1	0.0
PetrolRef	1.3	3.8	0.0	1.2	3.5	0.0

^a For rail freight, which becomes more efficient, we report an input-based measure of activity. Output, measured in ton-kilometres would increase.

Given our concerns about the likelihood of the Chongqing-Lichuan rail link in isolation opening up new mines (that is, relative to the overall Shanghai-Nanjing-Hefei-Wuhan-Yichang-Chongqing-Chengdu link), the most significant sectoral results shown in table 6 might be for rail passenger transport and tourism. With the efficiency gains in rail freight services, industry output declines. With additional demands from growing mining and carriage of other merchandise, we would expect rail freight services output to increase. Similarly, the sharp decrease in rail freight employment in Hubei and Chongqing may be offset by increasing freight volumes. Given China's rapid economic growth, the rail link will increase the freight-carrying capacity of Hubei, Chongqing and surrounding provinces. This means that as the regional economies grow, the transport infrastructure will be in place to deal with growing trade volumes.

Potential modifications to SinoTERM

Although SinoTERM contains a detailed sectoral representation of China by province, scope exists to develop the model further for particular areas of research. For example, some existing multi-regional models include fiscal accounts for national and sub-national governments. These link direct and indirect taxes plus various government expenditures to economic activity (Adams, *et al.* 2002). It is a challenge to unravel expenditures that already appear in the input-output table from transfers that do not. Doing so at a provincial level is even more difficult. Nevertheless, the process of estimating such data and working with statistical agencies would lead to an improved representation of government activity within the model. This would facilitate modelling of health and education issues at the regional level. This paper has analysed the effects of improved transport infrastructure. Arguably, the social benefits from improving access to health and education may be more important. The World Bank (2005) and Zhang and Kanbur (2006) present evidence of inequities in public expenditure on education and health across regions. Heckman (2003) presents evidence that the rate of return to investment in education in China is much higher than for infrastructure. Greater emphasis on human capital development may lead to a demand by policy makers for CGE modelling that uses econometric estimates of the benefits of health or education as inputs.

Another possible enhancement would be to include an income distribution module. Household incomes and expenditures may be represented in the model, for example, by income quintiles. Maybe this approach is less necessary in SinoTERM, as it already contains sufficient detail to capture income disparities between provinces and between urban and rural households by province.

Modelling income inequality would also require us to differentiate labour by skill types—because the meagre earnings of the less skilled form most of the income of poorer households. At the other end of the labour market, a skill disaggregation would allow us to model skill shortages which might constrain growth.

In the Australian experience, a lot of regional modelling has concerned water. Water scarcity is a growing issue in China as in Australia. The pattern in Australia is that when water is plentiful, agriculture accounts for around 70% of economic water usage. During the 2006-07 drought, this fell to around 50%. As cities grow, so too does urban water demand. The Australian Bureau of Statistics is gradually improving its water accounts. In the Australian experience, improved water accounts have made it easier to combine them with an input-output database for a CGE model. While one river basin—the Murray-Darling—dominates economic water use in Australia, China has several important river systems. Estimates of water usage by economic activity may be difficult to obtain for China. However, this could be a potentially rewarding area for future research. It may be practical to devise water accounts for a small number of regions and aggregate SinoTERM to focus on these regions.

Dynamics have already been added to a version of TERM (Wittwer, et al., 2005), following Dixon and Rimmer (2002). The main enhancement of dynamics is to link capital and investment over time. With a dynamic approach, the construction and operational phases are represented year-by-year in the same simulation. Such an approach allows us to model some of the costs of adjustment, as rates of return on capital adjust gradually following policy shocks to the model. We could extend dynamics by introducing net foreign assets, so that net foreign earnings feed into disposable income for each household – a highly relevant feature, given China's current massive trade surpluses at present. We could also introduce regional labour market dynamics to the model. This would allow partial adjustment in regional labour markets to occur over time in response to an economic shock.

Policy analysts are likely to become increasingly interested in regional economic modelling of greenhouse gas emission scenarios in China. Adams *et al.* (2002) describes a dynamic, multi-regional model (MMRF-Green) for Australia for such modelling. One key to linking greenhouse gas emission to economic activities is to split electricity generation into different fuels. In China's 2002 input-output table, coal accounts for 44% of all material inputs into electricity generation (National Bureau of Statistics, 2006). China is aiming to increase its renewable electricity generation. We could split the electricity generating sector to differentiate between the greenhouse gas emissions of each fuel. Possible electricity generation sectors might include coal-fired, gas-fired, nuclear, hydro-electric and other renewable components. It may be necessary also to split electricity into generation and supply components, as in MMRF-Green. This split allows electricity generators rather than users to make the choice of fuel types.

Ueta *et al.* (2006) used a comparative static multi-regional input-output framework to analyse greenhouse gas emissions in China. Existing dynamic economic modelling studies of China's greenhouse gas emission have had an international rather than sub-national focus (for example, McKibbin 2006). While a global model is an important tool in policy analysis, it cannot replicate either the sectoral or sub-national regional detail of a single country model. For ex-

ample, the detailed sectoral and regional data in SinoTERM provides a good basis for examining the economic implications of switching to various crops to supplement energy supplies and estimating the associated greenhouse gas impacts.

Conclusion

The Australian version of TERM has been applied to many different issues. These include the impact of the 2002-03 drought on Australia (Horridge, et al., 2005) and hypothetical improved weeds management in Australian agriculture (Wittwer, et al., 2005). A website (www.monash.edu.au/policy/term.htm) contains other applications and outlines other versions of the model.

We believe that the TERM approach can yield similar benefits for China. A detailed regional CGE model, such as SinoTERM, finds a host of applications among the real-world problems faced by policy-makers. Project evaluations, as seen in the simulation reported above, are but one important example. Issues of energy or food sufficiency also lend themselves to regional CGE analysis.

However, from the point of view of a regional analyst, China presents particular additional challenges. Compared to Australia, per capita income and economic growth rates differ more between regions, and inter-regional migration is more important. Hence, regional analysis accentuates China's dramatic economic and social changes.

References

- Adams, P., Horridge, M. & Wittwer, G. (2002). MMRF-Green: A dynamic multi-regional applied general model of the Australian economy, based on the MMR and MONASH models. Centre of Policy Studies, Monash University, Melbourne. Monograph available from URL: <http://www.monash.edu.au/elecpaper.htm>.
- Chang, G. (2002). The cause and cure of China's widening income disparity. *China Economic Review*, 12, 335-340.
- China.org.cn (accessed December 2006). An introduction to China's provinces, municipalities and autonomous regions. <http://www.china.org.cn/english/features/ProvinceView/163181.htm>
- Démurger, D., Sachs, J., Woo, W., Bao, S., Chang, G. & Millinger, A. (2002). Geography, economic policy and regional development in China. *Asian Economic Papers*, 1: 147-197.
- Dixon, P. & Rimmer, M. (2002). *Dynamic general equilibrium modelling for forecasting and policy: a practical guide and documentation of MONASH*. North-Holland: Amsterdam.
- Fan, S. & Zhang, X. (2004). Infrastructure and regional economic development in rural China, *China Economic Review*, 15, 203-214.
- Heckman, J. (2003). China's Investment in Human Capital. *Economic Development and Cultural Change*, 51, 795-804.
- Horridge, M, Madden, J. & Wittwer, G. (2005). Using a highly disaggregated multi-regional single-country model to analyse the impacts of the 2002-03 drought on Australia. *Journal of Policy Modelling*, 27, 285-308.
- Liu, T. & Li, K-W. (2006). Disparity in factor contributions between coastal and inner provinces in post-reform China, *China Economic Review*, 17, 449-470.
- McKibbin W. (2006) Global Energy and Environmental Impacts of an Expanding China. *China and the World Economy*, 14, 38-56.

- Ministry of Railways (2006), "People's Republic of China: Chongqing Railway Development Project", Environmental Assessment Report prepared for the Asian Development Bank, www.adb.org/documents/environment/PRC/39153-PRC-SEIA.pdf
- Naqvi, F. & Peter, M. (1996). A multiregional, multisectoral model of the Australian economy with an illustrative application. *Australian Economic Papers*, 35, 94-113.
- National Bureau of Statistics (NBS). (2006). *China statistical yearbook*. (CD)
- Okuda, T., Hatano, T. and Qi, S. (2004). An Estimation of a Multi-regional Input/Output table in China and the Analysis. Paper presented at the EcoMod Input-Output and Generali Equilibrium Date, Modeling, and Policy Analysis conference. Brussels, September 2-4.
- USDA (2006). Economic Research Service China Agricultural and Economic Data: Provincial Data, <http://www.ers.usda.gov/Data/China/ProvincialForm.aspx>
- Wittwer, G., Vere, D., Jones, R. & Griffith, G. (2005). Dynamic general equilibrium analysis of improved weed management in Australia's winter cropping systems. *Australian Journal of Agricultural and Resource Economics*, 49, 363-377.
- World Bank (2005, November). *Quarterly Update*, Beijing office.
- Yang, D. (2002). What has caused regional inequality in China? *China Economic Review*, 13, 331-334.
- Zhang, X. & Kanbur, R. (2005). Spatial inequality in education and health care in China, *China Economic Review*, 16, 189-204.
- Ueta, K., Inada, Y, Fujikawa, J., Na, S., Hayashi, T., Shimoda, M. and Mori, A. (2006) Site location of CDM projects: an input output analysis, Paper presented at the Environmental and Resource Economists 3rd World Congress. Kyoto, Japan, July 3-7.